Download R2R Values.xlsx

Tabs are ordered via date, left (newest) - right (oldest) which makes transparent the process that the Reorienting to Recovery Planning team went through to arrive at the current suite of refined values from the raw combined list of over 500 gathered from the online questionnaire and the workshop series in spring 2022.

Explanation of tabs

Value_Stmnt_Mapping (7.25.22) - Complete list of value statements, most of which are "mapped" to the refined value that represents the raw value (column D). This worksheet also includes our first attempt to categorize the values statements into groupings which we did not end up using in further refinement of the values list.

Refined Values (7.25.22) - First list of refined values, which removed duplicates while also attempting to capture all of the 500+ raw values statements.

Refined Values (8.18.22) - This worksheet includes an attempt to further refine and categorize the values statements. However, we did not end up using this categorization for further refinement of the values list becasue some felt these refined values statements left out some important inforamtion included in the previous list. Thus, we took a step back and only made some minor changes our original refined values statements. The final lsit of refined values are in the tab "Refined Values (9.7.22)".

Values and Metrics (11.9.22) - This tab indicates which SIT model input metric is most likely related to the refined values statement. Making these metrics spatially, temporally and numerically explicit so that values can be reflected in the SIT and winter-run lifescycle models will represent the bulk of the work we will be doing in this workshop series.

Refined Value	Number-for accounting	Value Type	General Metric	Metrics Tracking and Target Approach
Salmon - Spatial structure (presence in watershed(s) X,Y...) and abundance (Total and/ or watershed specific) targets	1	Decision	Fish	Requires generating life stage/ watershed specific abundance estimates in any given model year.
Salmon - Abundance (place specific) equivalent to historic abundance in year x	6	Decision	Fish	Same tracking approach as (1) + comparison to a historically generated target
Salmon - Abundance, (x?) productivity and distribution at a level that supports ecosystem health (including physical landscape, landscape processes and dynamics, chemical/ nutrient input, other species, etc.)	11	Decision	Fish	Same tracking approach as (1) and (7) + comparison to some threshold for ecosystem health for each objective metric (or all applicable)
Salmon - Biological Recovery objectives achieved and maintained by time X (15 years)	7	Decision	Fish	Requires ability for to compare model results to Recovery Biological objectives
Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Indigenous/ cultural	5	Decision	Fish	Requires 1) tracking adult ocean and in river abundance by watershed above what is necessary to maintain Recovery Productivity objectives in any given year AND 2) tracking some apportionment approach or total number for tribal harvest relative to those overall numbers.
Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Recreational	8	Decision	Fish	Same tracking approach as (5) + apportionment approach or total number for Recreation
Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Commercial	9	Decision	Fish	Same tracking approach as (5) + apportionment approach or total number for commercial

Refined Value	Number-for accounting	Value Type	General Metric	Metrics Tracking and Target Approach
Salmon - Hatchery production	13	Decision	Fish	Requires identification of metric for hatchery value other than abundance (e.g. number of functioning hatcheries, number of hatchery jobs, percentage of population truckable in dry years, etc.) OR can be considered action as opposed to value
Access - Lands/ waters that enable engagement with salmon - Indigenous/ Cultural	2	Decision	Land	Requires 1) accounting for locations and acreages by watershed and maintaining or increasing those acreages; 2) (Process) requires developing projects in ways/ locations that do not restrict access
Access - Lands/ waters that enable engagement with salmon - Recreation	3	Decision	Land	Same as (2) for lands with recreation access
Access - Lands/ water that enable engagement with salmon - Commercial	4	Decision	Land	Same as (2) for lands with commercial access
Access - Non-salmon wildlands/ wilderness	20	Decision	Land	Same as (2) for other public lands
Economics - Maintain or increase value of salmon (spatial structure and relative abundance target)	10	Decision	Money	Requires identifying an abundance and distribution (spatial structure) of fish that will support growing a) commercial and b) recreational salmon industries. *Note: after numbers are identified maybe the same as (1), and will exist on gradient with 1, 6, 7, 11)*
Economics - Salmon related jobs	48	Decision	Money	Same as (10) but with target related to jobs specifically as opposed to value of commercial and recreational industry
Economics - Water cost (mechanism as metric?)	17	Decision	Money	(hold for group?)
Economics - Food cost (mechanism as metric?)	18	Decision	Money	(hold for group?)
Economics - Relative cost in the context of limited resources	23	Decision	Money	(hold for group?)
Economics - Ag - Irrigation diversion (as business)	34	Decision	Money	(hold for group?)

Refined Value	Number-for accounting	Value Type	General Metric	Metrics Tracking and Target Approach
Economics - Ag - Farm and farm associated professions	35	Decision	Money	Requires tracking condition (preservation of existing ag function, modified ag function, or removal from production) of acres of ag land of different values/ designations under different action scenarios
Environmentally sound	32	Decision	Money	sound energy generation in project areas (e.g.
Economics - Regulatory extent and compliance	25	Decision	Money	regulatory compliance on lands of different
Water - Ag - Supply and delivery (maintain/ improve)	15	Decision	Water	supply in different years (e.g. percentage of
Water - Human use	22	Decision	Water	supply in different years (e.g. percentage of
Water - Non-salmon oriented recreation	19	Decision	Water	recreational water (e.g. flows above a certain
Water - Environmental water reliability	44	Decision	Water	environmental water (e.g. stream flow as
Water Rights (Maintained) (Proxy, Mechanism?)	37	Decision	Water	(rights associated with specific land areas,
Water - Groundwater sustainability	33	Decision	Water	with SGMA plan for specific watersheds
Water - Managed Wetlands - supply and operations	42	Decision	Water	a) water (e.g. current allocation relative to
Land/ Ecosystem - Food production and availability	21	Decision	Land	areas ag land type) and scale for tracking
Land/ Ecosystem - Flood risk and safety (maintain/ improve)	16	Decision	Land	stage/ required to impact urban areas and/ or
property and natural landscape features	26	Decision	Land	features" and 2) identification of proxy for
(mechanism/ proxy as metric?)	29	Decision	Land	water) cost for operation types and per unit
Land/ Ecosystem - Preservation of Natural Habitats	36	Decision	Land	habitats" to be preserved
ecological processes	43	Decision	Land	of riverine structural elements by watershed;
Bookends (best and worst case scenario) development	45	Process		conceptually for all metrics and contemplated
Lessons/ learnings from other places, systems	46	Process		with participants as a component of process
implementation	24	Process		project team and participants be actively
experimentation, risk	47	Process		and leaning into trust as central to process
Time spent in Nature	38	Process		processes and/ or designing actions that
Science and structured approach (transparency, clear objectiv	39	Process		?
Climate change consideration and integration	40	Process		scenarios as reference for modeled actions
Indigenous knowledge and wisdom	41	Process		participation, input, and leadership in process
Other processes and plans proceeding unencumbered	30	Process		process not negatively impacting others
indicator) including place-based and experiential	27	Process		actions so that it is integral as opposed to an

Refined Value	Number-for accounting	Value Type	General Metric	Metrics Tracking and Target Approach
and engagement	28	Process		feeling seen, included, and valued in a system
Potential for success	31	Process		??
honesty, transparency, care, orientation	12	Process		transparency with all parts of the process and
responsibility, scale	14	Process		impacts of the process and the actions it
misrepresented to promote a particular set of values	49	Process		information in the process in a manner that

Refined Value	Value Number-for accoiunting purposes	Value Type	Metric in model
Salmon - Spatial structure (presence in watershed(s) X,Y...) and abundance (Total and/ or watershed specific)	Value Number-for accoiunting purposes	Decision	Fish
Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Indigenous/ cultural	Value Number-for accoiunting purposes	Decision	Fish
Salmon - Abundance (place specific) equivalent to historic abundance in year x	Value Number-for accoiunting purposes	Decision	Fish
Salmon - Biological Recovery objectives achieved and maintained by time X (15 years)	7	Decision	Fish
Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Recreational	8	Decision	Fish
Salmon - Abundance, (x?) productivity and distribution at a level that supports ecosystem health (including physical landscape, landscape processes and dynamics, chemical/ nutrient	11	Decision	Fish
Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Commercial	9	Decision	Fish
Salmon - Hatchery production	13	Decision	Fish
Access - Lands/ waters that enable engagement with salmon - Indigenous/ Cultural	2	Decision	Land
Access - Lands/ waters that enable engagement with salmon - Recreation	3	Decision	Land
Access - Lands/ water that enable engagement with salmon - Commercial	4	Decision	Land
Access - Non-salmon wildlands/ wilderness	20	Decision	Land
Economics - Maintain or increase value of salmon (spatial structure and relative abundance	10	Decision	Money
Economics - Salmon related jobs	48	Decision	Money
Economics - Water cost (mechanism as metric?)	17	Decision	Money
Economics - Food cost (mechanism as metric?)	18	Decision	Money
Economics - Relative cost in the context of limited resources	23	Decision	Money
Economics - Ag - Irrigation diversion (as business) sustainability	34	Decision	Money
Economics - Ag - Farm and farm associated professions	35	Decision	Money
Power generation ability - Clean/ Environmentally sound	32	Decision	Money
Regulatory extent and compliance	25	Decision	Money

Refined Value	Value Number-for accoiunting purposes	Value Type	Metric in model
Water - Ag - Supply and delivery (maintain/ improve)	15	Decision	Water
Water - Human use	22	Decision	Water
Water - Non-salmon oriented recreation	19	Decision	Water
Water - Environmental water reliability	44	Decision	Water
Water Rights (Maintained) (Proxy, Mechanism?)	37	Decision	Water
Water - Groundwater sustainability	33	Decision	Water
Water - Managed Wetlands - supply and operations	42	Decision	Water
Land/ Ecosystem - Food production and availability	21	Decision	Land
Land/ Ecosystem - Flood risk and safety (maintain/ improve)	16	Decision	Land
features	26	Decision	Land
Land/ Ecosystem - Infrastructure and operations costs (mechanism/ proxy as metric?)	29	Decision	Land
Land/ Ecosystem - Preservation of Natural Habitats	36	Decision	Land
Land/ Ecosystem - Riverine structure and physical and ecological processes	43	Decision	Land
Bookends (best and worst case scenario) development	45	Process	
Lessons/ learnings from other places, systems	46	Process	
Coordinated, integrated planning, funding, and implementation	24	Process	
Optimism, hope, vision, imagination, novelty, experimentation, risk	47	Process	
Time spent in Nature	38	Process	
performance indicators, measuring success)	39	Process	
Climate change consideration and integration	40	Process	
Indigenous knowledge and wisdom	41	Process	
Other processes and plans proceeding unencumbered	30	Process	
experiential	27	Process	
Equitable, inclusive orientation and process - Tribal Inclusion and engagement	28	Process	
Potential for success	31	Process	
Equitable, inclusive orientation and process including honesty, transparency, care, orientation	12	Process	
Equitable, inclusive orientation and process - cost, responsibility, scale	14	Process	
particular set of values	49	Process	

#	Category	Refined value	Representative statement(s)	Refined value number(s) from 7.25.22 sheet
1	Salmon	Salmon (biological): Abundance	Abundance sufficient to support viable populations that result in low extinction risk, abundant natural origin spawners, a full range of ecological roles	6, 7
2	Salmon	Salmon (biological): Productivity	Productivity sufficient to support viability (as defined by VSP guidelines) and broad-sense recovery	7
3	Salmon	Salmon (biological): Spatial structure	Representation and redundancy of populations across the Central Valley sufficient to support local adaptation, minimize risk of extinction from catastrophes, and support natural levels of	1, 7
4	Salmon	Salmon (biological): Genetic diversity	Recover and preserve genetic diversity, including achieving a low proportion of hatchery-origin spawners (pHOS) and high genetic effective population size	7
5	Salmon	Salmon (biological): Life history diversity	Recovery and preserve life history diversity, including achieving diversity in habitat use, migration and spawning timing, and age distribution of spawning	7
6	Ecological	Ecosystem health: Land	Healthier, complex and dynamic freshwater, estuarine and ocean environments; improved habitat quality	11, 26, 36, 43
7	Ecological	Ecosystem health: Water	Increased water quality, flow; freedom of rivers, integrity of waterways	1, 11, 36, 43, 44
8	Ecological	Ecosystem connectivity	Connection between river and ocean; connection between water and land	1, 11, 43
9	Ecological	Managed wetlands	Concerned about impacts to managed wetlands throughout the valley	42
10	Ecological	Native species	Existence and persistence of native biological diversity	11
11	Traditional, recreational, commercial opportunities	Indigenous/cultural: Access to salmon habitat	Maintaining and preserving indigenous culture around salmon, including increasing access and rights to lands/rivers	2, 37, 38
12	Traditional, recreational, commercial opportunities	Indigenous/cultural: Opportunities for harvest	Maintaining and preserving indigenous culture around salmon, including use of salmon as food	5, 21
13	Traditional, recreational, commercial opportunities	Recreational: Access to salmon habitat and fishing	Increased recreational opportunities for fishing and sharing this with my children, connecting with nature	3, 20, 38

#	Category	Refined value	Representative statement(s)	Refined value number(s) from 7.25.22 sheet
14	Traditional, recreational, commercial opportunities	Recreational: Fishery sustainability and revenue	Financial impacts of fewer recreational opportunities	8, 10
15	Traditional, recreational, commercial opportunities	Recreational: Opportunities and access to habitat for	Impacts to recreational waterfowl hunting; recreational opportunities including fishing, boating	19, 38
16	Traditional, recreational, commercial opportunities	Commercial: Fishing opportunities	Increased fisheries benefits, i.e., opportunities and regions to fish for salmon, increased season lengths, increased harvest quotas	4
17	Traditional, recreational, commercial opportunities	Commercial: Fishery sustainability and revenue	The ability to support sustainable long-term commercial (and recreational) harvest levels that are both ecologically sound and economically viable for the	9, 10
18	Water quality & supply reliability	Water supply reliability for public water users	Better water supply reliability through stable regulation and operations; concerned about higher water rates and/or restrictions (e.g. # of days outdoor watering permitted)	22, 37, 42
19	Water quality & supply reliability	Water cost	Concerned about the increased cost of water and economic cascade	17
20	reliability	Water quality	operations, habitat restoration and management	15, 43, 44
21	reliability	Flood risk and safety	increased flooding	16
22	reliability	Groundwater sustainability	irrigation diverters to groundwater pumping will have a	33
23	reliability	Power generation	economical and environmentally-sound generation of	32
24	Agriculture	industry production	to continue to produce food in the Valley	21, 34, 35
25	Agriculture	ag	grow the food my family eats	15
26	Agriculture	Ag/food cost	leading to higher ag prices	18
27	Economic	recovery actions	ineffective and require additional water or money;	23, 29
28	Economic	permitting, agreements,	operations leading to mitigation requirements that are	13, 25
29	Economic	Jobs related to salmon	More people employed in salmon related jobs	48
30	Process	Collaboration	towards common goals; coordination across efforts;	12, 14, 24, 27
31	Process	Inclusivity	Diversity of engagement, including Indigenous groups	12, 14
32	Process	Transparency	Transparency of communication	12
33	Process	Learning	inform rational policy; the value/elevation of situated,	39, 41, 46

#	Category	Refined value	Representative statement(s)	Refined value number(s) from 7.25.22 sheet
34	Process	Awareness/education	role of Salmon in California; communicating knowledge	27
35	Process	Efficiency of other efforts	may be slow and thereby delay implementation of the	30
36	Process	Climate change	Need to recognize climate change	40
37	Process	Optimism	modes, making progress; need for collective creativity	47

Value Number	Refined Value	Value Type
1	Salmon - Spatial structure (presence in watershed(s) X,Y...) and abundance (Total and/ or watershed specific)	Decision
2	Access - Lands/ waters that enable engagement with salmon - Indigenous/ Cultural	Decision
3	Access - Lands/ waters that enable engagement with salmon -	Decision
4	Access - Lands/ water that enable engagement with salmon -	Decision
5	Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Indigenous/ cultural	Decision
6	Salmon - Abundance (place specific) equivalent to historic abundance	Decision
7	Salmon - Biological Recovery objectives achieved and maintained by	Decision
8	Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Recreational	Decision
9	Salmon - Harvest of a certain quantity (x number of fish) in specific location(s) in a certain percentage of years - Commercial	Decision
10	Economics - Maintain or increase value of salmon (spatial structure	Decision
11	Salmon - Abundance, (x?) productivity and distribution at a level that supports ecosystem health (including physical landscape, landscape processes and dynamics, chemical/ nutrient input, other species, etc.)	Decision
12	Equitable, inclusive orientation and process (including honesty,	Process
13	Salmon - Hatchery production	Decision
14	Equitable, inclusive orientation and process - cost, responsibility, scale	Process
15	Water - Ag - Supply and delivery (maintain/ improve)	Decision
16	Land/ Ecosystem - Flood risk and safety (maintain/ improve)	Decision
17	Economics - Water cost (mechanism as metric?)	Decision
18	Economics - Food cost (mechanism as metric?)	Decision
19	Water - Non-salmon oriented recreation	Decision
20	Access - Non-salmon wildlands/ wilderness	Decision
21	Land/ Ecosystem - Food production and availability	Decision
22	Water - Human use	Decision
23	Economics - Relative cost in the context of limited resources	Decision
24	Coordinated, integrated planning, funding, and implementation	Process
25	Regulatory extent and compliance	Decision
26	and natural landscape features	Decision
27	including place-based and experiential	Process
28	engagement	Process
29	proxy as metric?)	Decision
30	Other processes and plans proceeding unencumbered	Process
31	Potential for success	Process
32	Power generation ability - Clean/ Environmentally sound	Decision
33	Water - Groundwater sustainability	Decision
34	Economics - Ag - Irrigation diversion (as business) sustainability	Decision
35	Economics - Ag - Farm and farm associated professions	Decision
36	Land/ Ecosystem - Preservation of Natural Habitats	Decision
37	Water Rights (Maintained) (Proxy, Mechanism?)	Decision

Value Number	Refined Value	Value Type
38	Time spent in Nature	Process
39	testable hypotheses, performance indicators, measuring success)	Process
40	Climate change consideration and integration	Process
41	Indigenous knowledge and wisdom	Process
42	Water - Managed Wetlands - supply and operations	Decision
43	processes	Decision
44	Water - Environmental water reliability	Decision
45	Bookends (best and worst case scenario) development	Process
46	Lessons/ learnings from other places, systems	Process
47	Optimism, hope, vision, imagination, novelty, experimentation, risk	Process
48	Economics - Salmon related jobs	Decision

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	185	Get spring run above the rim dam	1	1	1		
Natalie	436	"What's good enough" mentality for salmon could come back to bite us with regard to salmon, but also everything connected to salmon (e.g., orcas)	1	1	1		
Rene	187	Connection to numerous rivers	1		1		
Natalie	239	Existence of salmon - non-use/non-consumption	1		1		
Natalie	289	What does the best case scenario related to abundance look like? Clarify term "abundance" which has many different meaning in relation to 'ocean' and 'land/river'	1		1		
Natalie	297	Avoiding extinction	1		1		
Natalie	298	Reducing extinction risk	1		1		
Natalie	324	the ability to encounter and experience wild salmon spawning, rearing and/or migrating	1		1		
Natalie	272	Feelings of alarm, urgency	7	1	1		1
Natalie	274	Immediate results after restoration	7	1	1		
Rene	88	Recovery and persistence of the species	7		1		
Rene	160	Recovery as an indicator of progress and a sign that our efforts are having an impact	7		1		
Natalie	236	Impacts of management, climate on water temperatures	7		1		1
Natalie	275	Urgency in restoring the populations	7		1		
Natalie	278	Don't wait until it's too late/situation is more dire to act	7		1		
Natalie	296	Natural production of anadromous fish	7		1		
Natalie	232	health for people and environment	11	1	1		
Natalie	233	Health: healthy water, environment, people	11	1	1		
Natalie	292	More ecologically diverse habitats, plants and wildlife	11	1	1		
Natalie	287	Benefits to wintering waterfowl	11		1		
Natalie	326	Restoring balance to our ecosystem; for the earth, plants, waters, flora and fauna, and the people.	11		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	473	Concerned that recovery actions may conflict with the needs of other ESA species	11		1		
	472	Concerned by potential near-term impacts on ocean harvest rates caused by shifting from hatchery production to more natural production	13		1		
	486	Concerned that too much compensation is provided for land and resource use	14		1		
	493	Concerned that water districts' responsibilities may be conflated with impacts to salmon outside of districts' control	14		1		
	494	Concerned that responsibility and cost for salmon recovery be allocated equitably	14		1		
Rene	226	Water supply reliability for agriculture	15		1		
Rene	231	Improving water supply by providing greater flexibility in how and when water is delivered to farms to grow food and cities for human use	15		1		
	464	Concerned about restraining water supplies for ag interests	15		1		
	495	Concerned about reduced agricultural water supply	15		1		
	467	Concerned that restoration projects may not incorporate flood considerations	16		1		
	502	Concerned about paying higher ("true") costs of goods grown/created in California	18		1		
	504	Concerned that higher water prices will mean higher food prices	18		1		
	484	Concerned that additional flows may be contentious as water rights are unclear	22	1	1		
	498	Concerned that a flow-only approach could negatively impact all beneficial uses of water (including Chinook salmon recovery)	22		1	1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	469	Concerned that resources be used judiciously	23		1		
	500	Concerned about the cost of fish screens	23		1	1	
Natalie	265	Stabilized, reasonably predictable regulatory environment	25		1		
	475	Concerned about greater restrictions	25		1		
	483	Some may view restoring channels to a more natural form to be destructive	26		1		
Natalie	256	Recognition of salmon resiliency, and our job is to undo harms done	27	1	1		
Natalie	252	Salmon are strong, responsive and resilient and have faced many challenges	27		1		
Rene	213	Preserving natural habitats despite cultural and societal externalities	36		1		
Natalie	318	climate change accommodation	40		1		1
Natalie	283	Not impacting existing management of Butte Sink area and other managed wetlands throughout the valley (e.g., state/federal managed wetlands)	42		1		
Natalie	288	Importance of wetlands	42		1		
Natalie	284	Freedom of rivers, integrity of waterways	43		1		
Natalie	313	Protect the beneficial use of water for fish and wildlife	44		1	1	
Natalie	319	More people employed in salmon related jobs	48	1	1		
Rene	141	Ecosystem Health/Vitality/Connection	1,11	1	1		
Rene	137	Connections between land, organisms and water (and fire)	1,11		1		
Rene	138	Connections between land/organisms	1,11		1		
Rene	140	Ecosystem health related to carcass loading	1,11		1		
Rene	142	Juveniles provide food to fish, sea birds, other predators (waterfowl); predation often framed as a negative but it's natural and was supported by productive historic runs	1,11		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	145	Salmon affect every other species they interact with	1,11		1		
Rene	146	Connection to/impact on other species, including ocean predators or terrestrial species in the CV who eat salmon	1,11		1		
Rene	147	Relationship between thing and place. Salmon are apart of everything, nitrogen pulse and nutrient source from the ocean (coevolution and co adaptation).	1,11		1		
Rene	148	Ecosystem processes - food webs	1,11		1		
Rene	153	Ecosystem benefits – salmon provide nutrients across the food web	1,11		1		
Rene	154	Movement of nutrients from the ocean inland by salmon contributes to more fertile soils (economic benefits to food and wine costs), and movement of nutrients to the ocean by out-migrating salmon feeds whales.	1,11		1		
Rene	155	Food web benefits of salmon to multi-benefit restoration projects	1,11		1		
Rene	156	the contribution of salmon to restoring and maintaining the larger Central Valley/Bay-Delta/nearshore ecosystem, such as nutrient loading and predator diet	1,11		1		
Rene	157	Salmon as an indicator of the healthy and integrity of the Bay-Delta	1,11		1		
Rene	158	Salmon as indicator of healthier ecosystems	1,11		1		
Rene	159	Salmon as an indicator/product of restored watershed health	1,11		1		
Rene	161	Indictor of holistic ecosystem health	1,11		1		
Rene	162	Salmon as symbol of health, environmental indicator/lens	1,11		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	163	Salmon as a unit of measurement for ecosystem health	1,11		1		
Rene	164	Salmon as an indicator species; if they're not doing well, then we're not doing well	1,11		1		
Rene	165	Salmon as an indicator species of health	1,11		1		
Rene	166	Salmon as indicator species	1,11		1		
Rene	167	Salmon as indicator of ecosystem health, water quality; benefits to ecosystem as a whole	1,11		1		
Rene	168	Salmon as indicator species for both community health and ecosystem health	1,11		1		
Rene	169	Concern over loss of salmon because they are an indicator species for ecosystem health	1,11		1		
Rene	170	Salmon represent a functioning ecosystem	1,11		1		
Rene	171	Salmon represent more than one ecosystem (numerous ecosystems must be healthy in order to have healthy and prosperous salmon populations)	1,11		1		
Rene	172	salmon as a proxy for water viability,	1,11		1		
Rene	173	whole ecosystem recovery	1,11		1		
Rene	188	Salmon represent more than one ecosystem (numerous ecosystems must be healthy in order to have healthy and prosperous salmon populations)	1,11		1		
Rene	196	Self-sustaining = healthy ecosystem = healthy social connections	1,11,12		1		
Natalie	261	Meeting co-equal goals of delivering waters and a sustainable ecosystem	1,11,15,22	1	1		
Natalie	262	Balancing management of water for human and non-human interests	1,11,15,22	1	1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	177	The importance of systems awareness within nature, acknowledging the systemic nature of natural systems, which also affects how we see ourselves and nature. Salmon also plays a role in this understanding natural systems	1,11,27	1	1		
Rene	204	Hatchery is life line	1,13		1	1	
Natalie	325	Stabilizing populations to allow irrigated ag to continue to produce food in the Valley	1,15,21		1		
Rene	58	Salmon tied with identity of place, geography	1,2		1		
Rene	63	Cultural value of salmon	1,2		1		
Natalie	263	Learning to balance the needs of nature and people reconnects us to nature and helps build momentum toward recovery of more ecosystems.	1,11,12,14,15,22,	1			
Rene	66	Desire for solutions that are more systemic, holistic, belonging-oriented	1,11,12,28	1		1	
Rene	80	Sharing salmon with kids	1,2,27	1	1		
Rene	54	Richness – multi-faceted interactions between communities/people and salmon	1,2,3,4		1		
Rene	39	Equal access to salmon for people & ecosystems	1,2,3,4,11,19.20		1		
Rene	108	Increased recreational opportunities for fishing and sharing this with my children, connecting with nature.	1,2,3,7		1		
Rene	134	Purchase wild salmon from my local fisherman, in season; so they are important dietarily and important to my local food economy.	1,2,4,5,8,9,		1		
Rene	93	Central to people's livelihood (e.g., fishermen) in more ways than one	1,2,4,9		1		
Rene	68	Cultural practices	1,2,5		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	69	Cultural and holistic wellness of marginalized people	1,2,5		1		
Rene	70	Indigenous cultural practices	1,2,5		1		
Rene	71	Traditional food and culturally significant to CA Indian Peoples.	1,2,5		1		
Rene	72	Maintaining and preserving indigenous culture around salmon	1,2,5		1		
Rene	73	continue to support cultural practices and economies that depend on natural resources.	1,2,5		1		
Rene	133	Traditional food and culturally significant to CA Indian Peoples.	1,2,5		1		
	487	Concerned that significant cultural connection to salmon has been lost in the Central Valley	1,27	1	1		
Rene	56	Urban wildlife as a sign of healthy communities and healthy modes of human living	1,27		1		
Rene	121	Recreation in watersheds with Salmon	1,3,		1		
Rene	123	Recreational salmon watching	1,3,		1		
Rene	124	Travel to see salmon	1,3,		1		
Rene	126	Recreation in salmon areas	1,3,		1		
Rene	98	Recreational and commercial opportunities around salmonids	1,3,4,8,9		1		
Rene	106	I fish for salmon in the ocean and snorkel in salmon spawning/staging areas once a year (and also lead others in experiencing salmon on their spawning grounds)	1,3,4,8,9		1		
Rene	122	Recreational and commercial opportunities around salmonids	1,3,4,8,9,10		1		
Rene	99	Fishing privileges taken away	1,3,8		1		
Rene	100	Fishing privileges taken away	1,3,8		1		
Rene	117	Strong recreational value for him and others (avid fisherman)	1,3,8		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	118	Recreation - playing and recreational catch	1,3,8		1		
Rene	119	Recreational fishing opportunities	1,3,8		1		
Rene	136	Subsistence and living off the land	1,5,8		1		
Rene	113	Increased fishing opportunities	1,5,8,9		1		
Rene	116	Increased fisheries benefits, i.e., opportunities and regions to fish for salmon, increased season lengths, increased harvest quotas	1,5,8,9		1		
Rene	129	the loss of a food resource	1,5,8,9		1		
Rene	130	Traditional source of food	1,5,8,9		1		
Rene	131	Food supply	1,5,8,9		1		
Rene	135	the ability to catch and eat salmon as a regular, substantial and healthy part of one's diet	1,5,8,9		1		
Rene	132	Food source	1,5,8,9,		1		
Natalie	328	enough salmon for resiliency, subsistence when salmon running and to store for year-round consumption.	1,5,8,9,11,		1		
Natalie	295	Natural resource for societal uses ranging from recreational/commercial fishing to educational opportunities	1,5,8,9,21		1		
Rene	29	Being able to experience wild salmon	1,7		1		
Rene	83	Legacy to leave healthy salmon populations for the next generation	1,7		1		
Rene	86	Diversity and extent of future generations' ability to engage with the natural world	1,7		1		
Rene	89	Ensuring generations to come can understand and respect the species	1,7		1		
Rene	90	Taking my daughter to our local streams to watch salmon spawn or snorkel with juvenile salmon.	1,7		1		
Rene	91	protect native species so they persist in the future,	1,7		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	92	Sustain salmon runs for future generations.	1,7		1		
Rene	183	Traditional/historic geographic range of salmon distribution	1,7		1		
Rene	184	Restoring spatial structure and abundance numbers	1,7		1		
Rene	186	Temporal and spatial distinctions – genetic complexity	1,7		1		
Rene	191	Temporal and spatial distinctions – genetic complexity	1,7		1		
Rene	195	Self-sustaining and resilient population	1,7		1		
Rene	197	Return to a natural, self-sustaining population	1,7		1		
Rene	198	Maintain, grow wild population	1,7		1		
Rene	199	Wildness/natural productivity (like what is seen in Alaska)	1,7		1		
Rene	202	Distinction between hatchery fish/natural fish	1,7		1		
Rene	210	Wildness/natural productivity (like what is seen in Alaska)	1,7		1		
Rene	212	Contrast between pristine salmon populations and CV salmon population	1,7		1		
Natalie	237	salmon as a proxy for water viability	1,7		1		
Natalie	242	Salmon populations should continue to exist in future	1,7		1		
Rene	87	Opportunities for future generations to experience the same moments with salmon; need to have fish around	1,7,		1		
Rene	209	Management of Salmon that allows spawning and production in the river	1,7,		1		
Natalie	311	Seeing thriving populations in their native streams	1,7,		1		
Natalie	293	Recovery and protecting biodiversity, land and water	1,7,11	1	1	1	
Natalie	291	Greater resilience	1,7,11		1		
Natalie	294	Existence and persistence of native biological diversity	1,7,11		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	211	Untouched rivers, and traditional and indigenous value	1,2,5,7,11,		1		
Rene	79	Psychological benefits from experiencing riverine, estuarine, and ocean ecosystems that support healthy wild salmon populations.	1,7,11,27	1	1		
Natalie	321	Meeting annual salmonid escapement targets and hatchery egg take goals, increase natural origin spawners, and increase natural origin populations.	1,7,13		1		
Rene	55	Integrating urban framework of human communities with natural processes, ecosystems, and species is essential; salmon can enable this due to the way they travel through bodies of water in urban areas	1,7,27	1	1		
Rene	61	Salmon as part of daily life including art	1,7,27	1	1		
Natalie	299	Recreating with family - spending time outdoors, fishing and eating salmon	1,7,3,8,		1		
Rene	223	Maintenance of water rights through recovery of fisheries	1,7,37	1	1	1	
Rene	85	The future generations ability to fish for salmon	1,7,8		1		
Rene	94	Central to livelihood	1,7,8,9		1		
Rene	96	Sustaining recreational, commercial fishing	1,7,8,9		1		
Rene	112	Reduced risk of fishery constraints arising from elevated listing statuses	1,7,9		1		
Rene	115	Building a healthy economy in sustainable fisheries	1,7,9,10		1		
Rene	114	Improve sportfishing opportunities	1,8,9		1		
Rene	120	Being able to be on the water with salmon with populations available to catch, eat, and recreate with	1,8,9		1		
Rene	109	Fishing industry benefits - higher catch rates, higher quality of fish, longer fishing seasons.	1,9		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	110	Healthy river processes that can support an abundant fishery	1,9		1		
Rene	111	Chinook fishery support (landings, revenue)	1,9,10		1		
Rene	107	the ability to support sustainable long-term commercial and recreational harvest levels that are both ecologically sound and economically viable for the fishing industry	1,9,10,11		1		
Rene	81	Leaving it the way we received it when we were kids	1,2,6,		1		
	566	Concerned about focusing on ESA triage (i.e., single-species recovery actions) as opposed to evolving ecosystem health (especially in the face of climate change)	11,25,40		1		
Rene	34	Importance of equal access not only to salmon but rivers and other species as part of the ecosystem	1,7,11, 12,28	1	1		
Rene	67	Need to be connected to your place/environment	11,12,27,28	1			
Natalie	320	Healthier, complex and dynamic freshwater, estuarine and ocean environments	11,43	1	1		
Natalie	308	Ensuring that species and habitats are protected and restored	11,43		1	1	
Natalie	317	Rivers that can support all life	11,43		1		
Natalie	303	Improved habitat quality and connectivity	11,43,44		1		
Natalie	304	Healthy waterways	11,43,44		1		
Natalie	307	Restoration projects resulting in increased water quality, flow, native species vegetation	11,43,44		1	1	
Natalie	264	More thoughtful use of water to benefit multiple purposes including human and environmental	11,14,22,	1			
Rene	228	water quality and quantity benefits,	11,15,22,		1		
	559	Concerned about impacts to recreational waterfowl hunting	11,42,19		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	558	Concerned that changes to the timing, depth and length of inundations in current managed wetlands could potentially impact waterfowl's food availability and access to foraging	11,42,44		1		
Natalie	259	Balance between natural and exploitative conditions/management	12,14	1			
Natalie	335	greater collaboration and less conflict	12,14	1			
	489	Concerned that salmon recovery may curtail hatchery operations leading to mitigation requirements that are difficult to achieve (which might in turn necessitate re-negotiating/re-writing licenses, agreements and permits)	13,25	1	1		
	468	Concerned that a focus on salmon population recovery needs to be balanced with human health and safety (especially where land is limited)	15,16,21,22		1		
Rene	227	Livable water supply situation	15,22		1		
Rene	230	Increase in water supply	15,22		1		
Natalie	375	Balanced Decision Making*	12,14	1			
Natalie	427	Personal ownership as well as collective ownership – self-accountability	12,14	1		1	
Natalie	266	Minimizing interventions and regulations that come at the expense of water project operation flexibility	15,25,29		1		
Natalie	267	Healthier water management	15,25,29		1		
Natalie	268	Better water quality and water supply reliability through stable regulation and operations	15,25,29		1		
Natalie	269	improve the flexibility in balancing multiple purpose projects like the CVP	15,25,29		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Natalie	270	Reduced impacts on CVP operations	15,25,29		1		
Natalie	271	Increase water management flexibility and ease pressure on reservoir operations	15,25,29		1		
	505	Concerned that removing dams could potentially cause increased flooding	16,26		1		
	471	Concerned that water management may reduce yields leading to higher ag prices	17,18		1		
	557	Concerned about higher rates for water consumption	17,22		1		
Natalie	446	Value of interaction across all areas of life - nature, non-human family members, fish.	12,14	1		1	
	492	Concerned that salmon recovery may increase water and/or infrastructure costs	17,29		1		
Natalie	314	Connectivity to natural systems and awareness of water resources (and their true cost)	17,43,44	1	1		
	524	Concerned that relying on massive public investment of funds (as opposed to water diverter mitigation) would be a negative impact to taxpayers	12,14	1			
	526	Concerned that salmon recovery may entrench the division, antagonism, and ideological enmity that has arisen pertaining to waters and lands in California (and other political flashpoints).	12,14	1			
Natalie	260	Balanced water uses/many needs for water - water for people, ag, environment	12,14,22,28,	1	1		
	567	Concerned that our regulatory and permitting systems are prone to the abuse of narrow interests and aren't up to the task of adaptation	12,14,25		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	496	Concerned about balancing human and non-human water supply interests – not clear if recovery would make this management easier or harder	24,25,29	1	1		
	564	Concerned that Tribes be engaged and heard	28,41		1		
	565	Concerned that traditional knowledge be respected	28,41		1		
	490	Concerned that salmon recovery may lead to short term reduction in recreation	3,19	1	1		
Natalie	235	Clean waters to use recreationally, swim in	3,19,11		1		
	466	Concerned about constraints on access to wild places	3,20		1		
Natalie	300	I fish for salmon in the ocean and snorkel in salmon spawning/staging areas once a year (and also lead others in experiencing salmon on their spawning grounds)	3,4,8,9		1		
Rene	105	Economic opportunities associated with recreational fishing/boating + related services	3,8,10,19,20		1		
Natalie	301	Recreational opportunities including fishing, boating and hiking	3,8,19,20		1		
Rene	225	Viability of legacy agriculture/family farms	34,35		1		
Natalie	407	Improved communication (Both for public and policy education)	12,14,27,28	1		1	
Rene	128	They are tasty	5,8,9		1		1
Natalie	309	Avoid putting all eggs in one geographic basket and account for inter-annual variability	7,11,40		1		
Natalie	310	Stable, sustainable population that may require support (e.g., from hatchery production, trap and haul)	7,11,40		1		
Rene	221	Recognition of salmon resiliency, and our job is to undo harms done	12,14,27,28,	1		1	
Natalie	253	Salmon are capable, must have opportunity to recover	7,27		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	474	Concerned that recovery actions may conflict with the needs of human consumption	7,8,9,21		1		
Rene	104	Recreational value	8,10		1		
	465	Concerned about constraints on recreational fishing opportunities	8,19		1		
	491	Concerned that salmon recovery may lead to short term reduction in consumption	8,9,10	1	1		
Rene	101	Economic valuation	9,10	1	1		
Rene	97	Economic decline of the fisheries - Economic Vitality	9,10		1		
Rene	102	Salmon have economic benefit	9,10		1		
Natalie	276	"Holding pattern" of current approaches			1		
Natalie	441	Legendary omnipresence of salmon	1				1
Rene	182	Spring run restoration work	7			1	
Rene	206	Return to a natural, self-sustaining population. Hatcheries could be a means to this end, if used effectively	7			1	
	525	Concerned that recovery through a hatchery-like (i.e., highly engineered, controlled, "optimal") environment would detract from the psychological, spiritual benefits I derive from wild salmon.	7				
Natalie	238	All species have value	11	1			
Natalie	330	Better managed water resources and floodplain management should have the potential to benefit not just salmon, but many wildlife species including waterfowl.	11	1			
Natalie	445	All species, including humans, are important	11	1			
	476	Concerned about single-purpose management	11	1			
Natalie	302	Ecosystem restoration and optimization.	11			1	
	511	Concerned that recovery may pull resources from other environmental action (i.e., opportunity cost of salmon recovery)	11				

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	545	Concerned about water going in the stream vs on the floodplain	11				
	547	Concerned about optimizing for salmon recovery without regard to achieving a broader suite of ecosystem objectives	11				
Natalie	349	Loving, caring, and compassion for people is important within a collaborative process	12	1			
Natalie	351	Uniting interests to gather information and reach agreement	12	1			
Natalie	352	Speaking to each other's interests	12	1			
Natalie	353	Holistic view of restoration - it takes a village	12	1			
Natalie	354	Importance of collaboration and moving to a place where decisions can be made collectively	12	1			
Natalie	355	Negotiation - finding wiggle room - where can we find space	12	1			
Natalie	356	Collaboration should not be a synonym for negotiation – importance of defining collaboration as collective decision making that is not limited to negotiation. Striving for collaboration EARLY in a process, not just at the point of decision making. There is some nervousness regarding collaboration in the sense of potential sacrifices.	12	1			
Natalie	357	Loving, caring, compassion for people in a collaboration process is important.	12	1			
Natalie	359	Valuing different perspectives	12	1			
Natalie	361	Collaboration and seeing different perspectives/from different fields (not only scientists)	12	1			
Natalie	363	Collaboration and synergy of public, different stakeholders	12	1			
Natalie	364	All hands on deck effort	12	1			
Natalie	429	Scale of the problem is necessary for a solution	12	1			
	485	Concerned that we are not addressing the deep-rooted issues that are necessary for salmon recovery	12	1			

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	503	Concerned about increased tensions with water stakeholders	12	1			
	527	Concerned about prolonged exposure to painful political discourse	12	1			
	528	Concerned that gridlock will draw us closer to a scary climate future	12	1			
	540	Concerned that recovery will require human populations to give up many things they take for granted so that ecosystem functions can be restored	12	1			1
	512	Concerned that compromise and collaboration may be difficult to achieve	12				
	513	Concerned that recovery actions may be viewed as a threat by some interested parties based on differing goals	12				
Rene	208	Baggage associated with hatcheries associated with current use; change current usage to move beyond this?	13			1	
Natalie	243	Appreciation of hardiness/wildness of species; don't distill down to a management need	14	1			
Natalie	336	Focus at the regional scale	14	1		1	
	521	Concerned about equitably assigning financial and regulatory responsibility	14				
	529	Concerned about potential impacts to water supply for agriculture	15				
	533	Concerned about impacts to water deliveries (e.g., functional flow requirements would reduce water supply for exports)	15				
	509	Concerned about increased flooding	16				

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	499	Concerned that salmon recovery could block off certain waterways for prioritization of restoration	22	1			
	514	Concerned about opportunity cost (i.e., tax revenue that could go to something else I value goes to salmon recovery instead).	23				
	517	Concerned about the cost of salmon recovery (e.g., funding habitat restoration projects)	23				
	534	Concerned about the cost and opportunity cost of salmon recovery (i.e., less money available for other things I value)	23				
	546	Concerned about the economic cost of implementation	23				
	470	Concerned that planning be coordinated across efforts	24	1			
Natalie	329	Fulfilling regulatory obligation to ensure SWP doesn't have a negative impact on salmon	25			1	
	549	Concerned that dealing with regulatory and water agencies is frustrating and takes a personal toll.	25				
Rene	1	Raising public awareness	27	1			
Rene	2	Children's education, and need for adult education as well	27	1			
Rene	3	Public awareness, and need for recovery	27	1			
Rene	4	Educational opportunities for children	27	1			
Rene	5	Public Education	27	1			
Rene	7	Making science accessible	27	1			
Rene	8	Education - life-long learning	27	1			
Rene	9	Public and neighbor education	27	1			
Rene	10	Understanding how to enable people to value nature no matter where they may come from	27	1			

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	11	Lack of knowledge is a barrier - improved public outreach	27	1			
Rene	12	An Aware Population	27	1			
Rene	13	Continuously learning about salmon	27	1			
Rene	14	Appreciation for role of Salmon in CA	27	1			
Rene	15	communication/educating others on Salmon including the next generation	27	1			
Rene	16	Educating self about salmon, have to find resources	27	1			
Rene	17	Need for more community awareness	27	1			
Rene	18	Scientific language disconnect - need to remove barriers between science and communities/broader public	27	1			
Rene	19	Education about fish/salmon	27	1			
Rene	20	Acknowledgement and respect for the system that salmon exist within – as well as an acknowledgement of how people feel around salmon is tied with how people understand these systems. Alternatively, in understanding the value in a system, it helps us value ourselves	27	1			
Rene	64	Cultural awareness of salmon	27	1			
Rene	74	Salmon are sacred	27	1			
Natalie	240	Privilege to have salmon as part of life	27	1			
Natalie	241	Inherent value of species	27	1			1
Natalie	247	Realization that without healthy ecosystems, we lose a part of ourselves – it's up to us to protect them	27	1			
Natalie	248	Responsibility, stewardship, protection	27	1		1	
Natalie	249	Importance of being stewards to local area as well as the greater planet	27	1		1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Natalie	250	Idea of being a good steward; conservation biologist at heart, being an advocate for species and protecting species beyond instrumental value	27	1		1	
Natalie	251	Strong conservation ethic	27	1			
Natalie	400	Understanding the unintended consequences of good intentions, understanding our past as crucial to better future	27	1		1	
Natalie	405	Communication at different conceptual levels – discussion of water, salmon has larger symbolic meanings relating to future visions, protecting life on the planet	27	1			
Natalie	406	Science communication that is accessible	27	1			
Natalie	442	What we need from salmon/what we think salmon need – not necessarily what salmon actually need	27	1			1
Natalie	456	Self education and iterative processes - change is not static	27	1			
Natalie	457	Theme of concern for our situation and concern over the process, feeling of deep responsibility to be involved in this process	27	1			
Natalie	459	Salmon do not just represent an ecosystem; they are more fundamental to helping people draw their own	27	1			1
Natalie	460	Overlapping scientific and recreational value	27	1			1
Natalie	461	Opportunities to help salmon that are already very resilient thrive, and weaving that into a way of life	27	1		1	
	501	Concerned that greater abundance will just result in over-harvesting	27	1			1
Rene	62	Grew up with salmon culture	27				1
Rene	65	Salmon culture isn't present	27				1
	497	Concerned that the Reorienting to Recovery project may be slow and thereby delay implementation of the Bay Delta Plan	30	1			
	520	Concerned about potentially setting unachievable goals that will set us up for failure	31				

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	531	Concerned about setting overly ambitious objectives given the factors beyond our control (e.g., drought years, ocean conditions, factors outside our geographic region of concern)	31				
	530	Concerned that salmon recovery may impact the economical and environmentally-sound generation of power and delivery of water	32				
	543	Concerned about putting irrigation diverters out of business	34				
Rene	28	Time spent in wilderness is important to frame our paradigm for sustainability	38	1			
Natalie	440	Nature is not a separate destination or a foreign entity	38				1
Natalie	333	Setting quantifiable recovery targets and 'SMART' performance metrics	39	1		1	
Natalie	334	improved scientific understanding and information to inform rational policy	39	1		1	
Rene	194	Resiliency - witnessed positive response post-management	39				
Natalie	338	Determining the priority of restoration actions	39			1	
Natalie	280	Need to recognize climate change	40	1		1	
Natalie	281	The value/elevation of situated, place-based knowledge	41	1		1	
Natalie	285	The number of unhoused communities negatively impacting rivers/riverbanks *based on societal changes	43	1		1	
Natalie	286	Better reliability of water for salmon	44	1		1	
Natalie	290	What is the worst case scenario? The species goes extinct, the loss of a food resource	45	1			
Natalie	425	Borrowing/leveraging/sharing information from other systems outside the Central Valley	46	1		1	
Natalie	424	Learning from other systems – how have others addressed similar wicked issues?	46			1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Natalie	372	Moving past a conflict/adversarial dynamic	47	1			
Natalie	384	Oscillation between hopefulness and fear/helplessness; hopefulness is fed by connection and community	47	1			1
Natalie	392	Need for collective creativity	47	1			
Natalie	393	Openness to risk	47	1			
Natalie	394	Receptivity to new ideas/new modes	47	1			
Natalie	396	Importance of stepping out of the box to create solutions –	47	1			
Natalie	397	Openness to break free from the way things have done, historic modes/actions	47	1			
Natalie	401	Limited human foresight – so complex we lack ability to foresee our impacts, even with good intentions	47	1			
Natalie	417	A hopeful mindset	47	1			
Natalie	419	Hope and dedication	47	1			
Natalie	420	Recognizing the resilience of ourselves and others	47	1		1	
Natalie	421	Optimism and hope for opportunities that are not based in conflict	47	1			
Natalie	422	Optimism despite widespread resource challenges not only limited to salmon	47	1			
Natalie	439	Idea of how we move from short-term fixes or appeasing multiple interests that don't achieve anything substantive. We need to work more on our long-term vision and shared visions. Need to work towards establishing common ground and working towards long-term solutions rather than solely focusing on short-term fixes	47	1		1	
Natalie	443	Openness to environmental recovery, making progress	47	1			
Natalie	389	The past is not a solution for the future – not ignoring the past, but acknowledging competing interests surrounding environmental issues	47			1	
Natalie	398	Looking for out of the box solutions	47			1	
Natalie	399	Novel approaches	47			1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	139	Connection to inorganic – waterways as living creatures	1,11	1			
Rene	175	Watershed/ecosystem-based management	1,11	1		1	
Rene	176	Ecosystem recovery effort - not just salmon	1,11	1		1	
Rene	149	Marine derived nutrients deliveries would make riparian areas and the surrounding forests healthier, more fire resistant, more biodiverse and more resilient to climate change	1,11				
Rene	218	Healing of landscape/repair of ecosystems	1,11			1	
Natalie	408	Diversity of individuals in the salmon community and the intersection with the ecosystem	12,14,27,28,41,	1			
Rene	219	Colonial repair and healing	12,14,28	1		1	
Rene	143	connections to water and land	1,11,27	1			
Rene	144	Connection between river and ocean	1,11,27	1			
Rene	178	Seeing and appreciating all the parts of natural systems - the whole life cycle of salmon	1,11,27	1			
Natalie	312	Stewardship of the environment and local resources	1,11,27			1	
Rene	193	Desire for diverse forms of healthy natural world that people can spend their time within	1,11,38	1			
Rene	201	No preference between hatchery fish versus wild fish	1,13			1	
	537	Concerned about committing resources in watersheds that won't be able to support salmon due to higher water temperatures from climate change	1,31				
Rene	30	Quality and quantity of time with natural resources	1,38	1			

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	57	productive ecosystems got that way because of people (as a keystone species), recovery of ecosystems with recovery of people that are coevolved from that place. For that to happen we have to do work on ourselves and work on the system structures that are unjust. People have to relate to place.	1,7,11	1			
Natalie	455	Not remembering a time when salmon were not imperiled	1,7,27				1
	555	Concerned about lack of commercial harvest and seasonal availability	1,9				
	561	Concerned about negative economic impacts (e.g., higher taxes and/or utility fees to support State or privately funded restoration efforts)	10,17,18,23,34,35,48			1	
Rene	44	The value of economic valuation for education and influence (convincing decision makers to invest/fund efforts)	10,24,27	1			
Rene	220	Assessing dams, levees, channelizing - destruction of habit. Address past harms	12,14,28	1		1	
Natalie	413	Diversity of engagement	12,14,28	1			
Natalie	448	Finding awakenings to nature - salmon specifically	11,27,38			1	
Natalie	331	Greater awareness of the importance of floodplain habitats (wetlands) to aid in salmon recovery can result in a greater and more stable reliability of water for those wetlands. An increased reliability and supply of water for wetlands would benefit waterfowl.	11,27,42	1		1	
Rene	31	Emphasis on the value of having access to healthy ecosystems and habitats for EVERYONE	11,38	1			
Natalie	414	Safe spaces - being heard	12,14,28	1			
Natalie	415	Cross culture/sector dialogues	12,14,28	1		1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Natalie	416	Getting a lot of voices and groups in the room at the same time is crucial	12,14,28	1		1	
Natalie	426	Everyone owns/manages their own piece of the watershed – everyone needs to work together towards good stewardship; everyone is responsible	12,14,28	1		1	
Natalie	409	Disconnect of resources in community especially for underrepresented groups	12,14,28,41	1			
Natalie	410	Privilege and power has responsibility! We need to help, raise up and empower those with less privilege and power.	12,14,28,41	1		1	
Natalie	388	Community and collaboration to work together towards common goals	12,14,28,47	1			
	522	Concerned about losing buy-in of interested parties if our approach isn't balanced and our objectives aren't actionable	12,14,31				
	568	Concerned that society has lost the institutional ability to make and implement balanced decisions, monitor the impacts and course correct to maintain balance	12,14,39		1		
Natalie	376	Creative ways to balance different objectives and priorities	12,14,39,47	1			
Natalie	432	Seeing the big picture in order to see ourselves	12,14,47	1	1	1	
Natalie	370	How to integrate competing interests with a shared ecology	12,14,47	1			
Natalie	373	Rejection of traditional negotiation style problem solving where you must give	12,14,47	1		1	
Natalie	430	Seeing on a larger scale; seeing on a big picture in order to see ourselves as well	12,14,47	1			
Natalie	433	Opportunity to dismantle stereotypes (recognize multiple identities)	12,14,47	1			
Natalie	447	Solutions based mindset	12,14,47	1			
Natalie	431	Since living and breathing in nature since moving West, there was an intensification of the realization that happiness comes from being able to see the largescale of things	12,14,47				1

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	562	Concerned that salmon recovery may lead to more litigation	12,23,25		1		
Rene	45	when we discuss salmon and negotiate we do it in a way that many people in the state generally do not care about. For example, agriculture as a main water use clashes with discussions of salmon in more esoteric, data-based terms. Need to communicate these concerns in a way that more people can understand and relate to; need to translate these issues into peoples' day to day lives	12,24, 27,28	1			
Natalie	385	Community as a way of decolonizing education and science	12,27	1			
Natalie	404	Transparency in communication!	12,27	1		1	
Rene	6	Education - horizontal, non-hierarchical learning, in the community,	12,27,28	1			
Rene	22	Sharing experiences	12,27,28	1			
Rene	46	Community/work/social connection and impact	12,27,28	1			
Rene	47	Connecting people and communities and working together	12,27,28	1			
Rene	50	Nature is integral to human existence, communities, and the ways that we spend time together.	12,27,28	1			
Rene	51	Moments in nature helped enable feelings of belonging and connection for storyteller	12,27,28	1			
Rene	53	Storyteller reiterated being able to see on a larger scale and emphasized connectivity – the more you can connect people to something,	12,27,28	1			
Rene	48	Society needs a connection to the environment	12,27,28,38	1			

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	52	Shared experiences in nature enables healthy communities	12,27,28,38	1			
Natalie	449	Need to recognize the social studies/social aspects of the issue	12,27,39	1		1	
Natalie	387	Power of salmon to unite people, build community	12,27,47	1			
Natalie	386	Rebuilding; also contributed to sense of community	12,27,47			1	
	488	Concerned that Tribal communities be engaged in this process	12,28	1	1		
Rene	32	No one is disposable	12,28	1			
	544	Concerned that past recovery efforts have focused on simple, insufficient answers (e.g., just sending more water downstream)	12,31				
Natalie	365	Importance of shared visions, group planning, and imagining a world together that we can work towards collectively. But the shared vision needs to be grounded in a realistic context	12,47	1			
Natalie	366	Main challenge is to get people in the right headspace (farmers, flood managers, agencies, and NGOs) to work together	12,47	1			
Natalie	367	Collaboration to find new solutions	12,47	1			
Natalie	368	Working towards a common goal and leaving the world as a better place	12,47	1			
Natalie	369	Belief in work to overcome existing barriers	12,47	1			1
Natalie	350	Importance of long-term vision and shared visions; need for new shared vision of our lives, communities, and futures	12,47			1	
Rene	229	Improving water supply reliability	15,22,		1		
Rene	222	Supporting salmon translates directly into better water supply (regulation on salmon can hurt water supply)	15,22,25		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	542	Concerned that shifting significant water supply from irrigation diverters to groundwater pumping will have a negative economic impact and a negative impact on groundwater sustainability	15,22,33				
	532	Concerned about the increased cost of water and economic cascade	17,18,22,23				
	481	Concerned that some salmon recovery actions may be ineffective and require additional water or money	17,22,23		1		
Rene	35	Storyteller emphasized the importance of enabling people to access certain natural spaces that have been walled off	2,3,4,19,20		1		
Rene	36	sadness that comes with coming to a community where a natural space is private and inaccessible to the public	2,3,4,19,20		1		
Rene	37	Access to nature	2,3,4,19,20		1		
Rene	38	Equal access to nature for all, especially ensuring that traditional wilderness areas are accessible to all	2,3,4,19,20		1		
	541	Concerned about meeting hatchery obligations established in hatchery operating and maintenance agreements	13,25				
	553	Any new regulatory requirements related to the SWP must be commensurate with impacts from the SWP (which means they won't be able to fully address all the problems salmon are facing)	14,25				
	516	Concerned about higher water rates and/or restrictions (e.g. # of days outdoor watering permitted)	15,17				

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	518	Concerned about impacts to water availability and cost (e.g. base flow, pulse flows, reduced flexibility on when/where/how much water can be pumped)	15,17,22				
	535	Concerned that efforts to increase juvenile survival may require additional flows to maintain cool water or cue/support juvenile outmigration	15,17,22				
	510	Concerned about reduced farming	15,21				
	539	Concerned about reducing water supply to farms that grow the food my family eats	15,21				
	507	Concerned about less water available for urban and/or ag use	15,22				
	551	Concerned that re-operation of dams may impacts water supplies for communities	15,22				
	556	Concerned about reduction in available water supply	15,22				
Rene	21	Being able to experience the outdoors and the water	2,3,4,38	1			
	536	Concerned that establishing salmonids in different watersheds could lead to more pumping restrictions (due to greater juvenile entrainment at the SWP/CVP)	15,25,29,				
	550	Concerned about agricultural losses	15,35,34				
	506	Concerned about increased costs for water and/or food	17,18				
Rene	33	All nature should be accessible to everyone to enjoy.	2,3,4,38	1			
Rene	224	Human rights to water – exacerbation of private well failure (surface/groundwater relationship)	22,33	1		1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	552	Concerned about financial impacts of fewer recreational opportunities and less water availability	3,15,17,19,20,22,23				
	523	Build trust and buy-in through early successes and then scale effort	31,12,14				
Natalie	277	Progress and efficient decision making	24,39	1		1	
Rene	26	Experiencing/reading the landscape →wonder	27,28	1			
Rene	23	Experience of the environment (and discovery of new environments)	27,38	1			
Rene	24	Encounters of wildlife (especially for young people)	27,38	1			
Rene	25	Awe/encountering	27,38	1			
Rene	27	Importance of time spent in nature	27,38	1			
Natalie	378	Science as an important tool for understanding and supporting the process	27,39	1			
Natalie	379	Science is important but not the answer	27,39	1			
Natalie	380	Science, and environment	27,39	1			
Natalie	381	Science in complex systems	27,39	1			
Natalie	382	Finding connections to science	27,39	1			
Natalie	377	Science as an important tool for realizing these desired holistic visions/solutions; healthy role of science in realizing these visions	27,39,47	1			
Natalie	395	Develop a culture of change (e.g. fire suppression is no longer a preferred method of management. Example can be useful here?)	27,47			1	
Natalie	458	Reorienting our view of abundance - where do we find value	27,47			1	
Natalie	411	Tribal Community Outreach	28,41	1		1	
Natalie	412	Working with Paiute tribes and learning about the importance of salmon to them	28,41	1		1	
	560	Concerned that reducing recreational hunting opportunities will remove the incentive to manage private wetlands which could lead to degraded wetland habitats	42,43		1		

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
	515	Concerned about temporary or permanent loss of access to recreational areas or activities (e.g. areas and/or times fishing is allowed).	3,19				
	538	Concerned about closing access to recreational areas or further limiting sport fishing opportunities	3,19,20				
Natalie	374	Not politicizing salmon - Prioritize recovery, not preferred outcomes associated with one group or another	7,12,14	1		1	
	548	Concerned that changes to the management of inundation actions could negatively impact farmers and related jobs	34,35				
Natalie	438	Embrace of "unconventional" styles of engagement with nature beyond traditional/stereotypical ideas of nature engagement	38,47	1		1	
Natalie	383	Science and heart - need for analytical and passion	39,47	1			
Natalie	337	Managing salmon with future conditions in mind, rather than recreating the historical structure/habitat of the Delta	40,47			1	
Rene	42	Climate of opportunity (resources and regulatory changes to facilitate achievement of objectives)	7, 25	1		1	
Natalie	360	Bridging communities to work towards recovery	7,12	1			
Natalie	362	Reduce contentiousness of recovery in CA	7,12,27	1			
Rene	49	Nature is not something separate from humans; healthy salmon populations are part of healthy communities	7,12,27,28		1		
Natalie	418	Habitat restoration/improvement for the salmon brings hope/potential	7,27,47	1			
	554	Concerned about recreational angler curtailment	8,19				
Rene	40	Social commitment to make restoration efforts persistent		1			

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	41	the more they will care about it and the more they will be willing to take action		1			
Rene	76	Spiritual benefit (human beings acknowledging their culpability for and rectifying declining populations)		1			
Rene	84	Forging intergenerational connections		1			
Rene	95	Work, jobs, especially in science		1			
Rene	103	The value of economic valuation for education and influence (convincing decision makers to invest/fund efforts)		1		1	
Rene	127	Clean waters to use recreationally, swim in		1			
Rene	174	Suitable conditions		1			
Rene	179	number or acres of restored habitat		1			
Rene	180	Number of multi-benefit projects		1			
Rene	181	Experiencing benefits of salmon restoration projects		1			
Natalie	244	Existence value		1			
Natalie	245	The intrinsic value that native species bring to the environment and society		1			
Natalie	254	Humans to get out of the way to allow Salmon to thrive/persist		1		1	
Natalie	257	Integrating the needs of salmon/creating sustainable ecosystems with competing needs of humans		1			
Natalie	258	Understanding the competing needs of resources-human and species perspectives		1			
Natalie	279	Seasonal life cycles impacted by drought/climate change/environmental occurrences		1		1	
Natalie	282	Need for more knowledge of the river, live real time data (vs forecasted data)		1		1	
Natalie	306	improving investments in restoration		1		1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Natalie	315	Providing a sense of place and overall quality of life for Californians		1		1	
Natalie	316	Support the interdependent link between rice and salmon		1		1	
Natalie	327	Honoring the importance of Salmon responsibilities.		1			1
Natalie	340	Political unity = greater harmony		1			
Natalie	341	improved partnerships and relationships within the water and environmental communities		1			
Natalie	342	Coordination and collaboration between wildlife, habitat, water and agricultural resource managers can ideally benefit all stakeholders.		1		1	
Natalie	343	Importance of partnerships and collaboration to make this work, and allowing groups to leverage their own strengths		1		1	
Natalie	345	Importance of collaboration		1			
Natalie	346	Concerns over defining the term collaboration – discussion that collaboration should not be synonym for negotiation. Established the importance of defining collaboration as collective decision making that is not limited to negotiation.		1			
Natalie	347	Striving for collaboration EARLY in a process, not just at the point of decision making		1			
Natalie	348	This discussion also relates to concerns that stakeholders sometimes are operating at a level lower and prioritizing short-term fixes rather than a holistic, whole long-term vision		1		1	
Natalie	358	Problem solving		1			
Natalie	371	Conflict as an opportunity		1			
Natalie	402	Need for new solutions		1			
Natalie	403	Other ways to find solutions		1			
Natalie	423	Taking stock of loss and how it can guide us		1		1	
Natalie	428	Central to becoming empowered and self-reliant		1			
Natalie	435	Proactive instead of reactive		1			
Natalie	437	Joy of fish nerdery – enjoyment of observing other's passions		1			

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Natalie	450	Connection to their life cycle, but theirs is one we can see and potentially impact positively		1		1	
Natalie	452	Big part of her personal identity (connection to lakes, childhood, and fishing)		1			
Natalie	453	The fix, not the fight		1			1
Natalie	463	"Dirty bandage"; leads to long-term problems		1			
	477	Concerned about taking the full range of factors impacting salmon health and recovery into account (i.e., not just human-induced factors)		1		1	
	478	Concerned that conflict and uncertainty may delay recovery		1			
	479	Concerned with inaccuracies related to models – consider quantifying uncertainty of models for decision-makers		1			
	480	Concerned about balancing functional recovery with multiple demands from various interested parties		1			
	482	Concerned that collaboration and compromise may be hard to achieve resulting in a slow, frustrating process		1			
	508	Concerned about political fallout from difficult decisions		1			1
	519	Concerned that recovery may result in some collaboration, partnership and/or litigation challenges		1			
Rene	43	Strong funding source from local utility				1	
Rene	59	Salmon are hidden					1
Rene	60	Salmon are underestimated/underappreciated in CA compared to Salmon culture in PNW					1
Rene	75	Spiritual fulfillment					1
Rene	77	Psychological and spiritual wellness					1

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Rene	78	Religious practice around protecting and living for the benefit of all beings					1
Rene	125	“Salmon nerds”					1
Rene	189	Unique ecological world					1
Rene	190	In awe of salmon’s ability to return to their native streams					1
Rene	192	Evolution					1
Rene	200	Hatchery production, water flows				1	
Rene	203	Using hatcheries for recovery [observation rather than a value; hatcheries can play a role in recovery]				1	
Rene	205	How we use hatcheries needs to change dramatically for them to be a beneficial tool				1	
Rene	207	Laws that govern salmon (ESA, CWA, CVPIA) put value on natural population (i.e., not hatchery production) – already embedded in values of existing legal structure				1	
Rene	214	Remove barriers in the Sutter Bypass, fish ladders, weir notching				1	
Rene	215	fixing levees in a “river friendly” way (connectivity btw river and fish)				1	
Rene	216	changing recertification requirements for dams				1	
Rene	217	Dam removal as part of healing the landscape (dams as incarceration)				1	
Natalie	234	Cold water					1
Natalie	246	Being a protector				1	1
Natalie	273	Streamlining green tape initiatives				1	
Natalie	305	Creating habitat for people and wildlife				1	
Natalie	322	Relieve pressure on specific tributaries to sustain runs				1	
Natalie	323	Multi-beneficial floodplains.				1	

Reviewer	#	Values Statement	Refined Value (for 7.25.22 sheet)	Process	Decision objective	Action	Wildcard
Natalie	332	Improving conditions in the Delta (water quality, flows, habitat, predation management, suppression of invasives, channel maintenance, barriers, levee maintenance, etc.) which aid salmon migration will also improve overall ecosystem health and function.				1	
Natalie	339	Validation of our efforts				1	
Natalie	344	Need new shared vision of our lives, communities, and futures				1	
Natalie	390	Large problem necessitates a larger solution				1	
Natalie	391	Amazement at historic actions/hubris					1
Natalie	434	People that work and live in the Valley truly care about this issue (contrary to what some might think); expands the realm of opportunities					1
Natalie	444	Everyone knew salmon recovery effort was happening (like a branding effort)					1
Natalie	451	Represents personal connection to nature and cycle of life as a species					1
Natalie	454	Strong emotional connection (impact of salmon runs on mood, reflection of how he feels about world at large)					1
Natalie	462	Extraordinary conditions for run of '92 fish and lead to snowball effect in subsequent years of successful fish					1
	563	Concerned that salmon recovery may require more supplementation through salmon culturing				1	